International Initiative for Impact Evaluation

Checklist for PBR

1. Before running the code:
   - Read the paper carefully and identify all the results presented in the text, tables and figures of the published paper.
   - Select the paper's key result and register a brief justification in the OSF platform in the "Final report and key result" subcomponent.
   - Make a copy of the files before working with them (following the naming convention 3ie provides). All the original files received from the authors should be uploaded in the private "Original data" OSF subcomponent.
   - Verify that you received all documents that the authors said they were going to send. If you have not received all the documents, contact the authors.
   - Read replication instructions if the authors sent them.
   - Check that the files received correspond to the published paper. It is possible that several versions of the paper exist (if it is not possible, check this at the third stage).
   - Review files:
     - Review codebooks. It is important that you recognize the name of the main variables.
     - Confirm that you have access to the data files.
     - Read the .do files and understand what they did and which tables/results they produced.
     - Check output documents (logs, excel tables) if they are provided by the authors.

2. Running the code:
   - Change the file paths on the .do files if necessary.
   - Ensure that all programs needed to run the code are installed on your computer.
   - Use the same version of software that was used by the original authors.
   - Run the code, logging the results (some codes will do this automatically).
   - The documents that contain the output of the statistical analysis (e.g., a log file) will be uploaded in the "Analysis" OSF subcomponent
   - Troubleshoot if the code does not run. For example: ensure all necessary packages are installed in the statistical program, or try running the code in an older version of the statistical software.
   - If it is impossible to run most of the code, contact the original authors, explain the situation, and see if they have a suggested course of action (e.g. alternative data).
   - If the results obtained are incomplete, contact the authors, explain the situation and ask them if they can send the complete code and data.

3. Comparison:
   - Reproduce original tables using log/output files (to do this carefully read the description of each table). It is not important to format the PBR tables in the same manner, simply reproduce them following the final report template. If the original authors reported statistical significance levels instead of p-values, report the p-values in the replicated tables (this is the only case in which you should include information that was not reported in the original table).
   - Compare the original tables with the tables replicated. Use the color-coding provided in the Final report template (excel file) to represent the differences between the replicated tables and the original publication.
   - In case there are differences, check again the log/outputs files.
   - If it is necessary, write the differences found in each table following the template provided.
   - Select the classification for each table.
   - Select the classification for the replication and write the justification.
   - Complete the report and share the final report (along with appendices) with the 3ie, by uploading the report in the private “Final report and key result” subcomponent.